

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
AT CHARLESTON**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:</b>  <i>Cases Listed in Plaintiffs' Exhibit A</i>	<b>Wave 9</b>  <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**NOTICE OF ADOPTION OF PRIOR RESPONSES IN OPPOSITION TO *DAUBERT*  
MOTION TO EXCLUDE EXPERT TESTIMONY OF MARSHALL SHOEMAKER, M.D.**

In response to Plaintiffs' notice adopting their prior *Daubert* motions as to Marshall Shoemaker, M.D. (Doc. 8291 (adopting Docs. 4328 & 4329)), Defendants hereby adopt and incorporate by reference their prior responsive briefing (Doc. 4551) in opposition to the motion to exclude Dr. Shoemaker's testimony. Defendants respectfully request that the Plaintiffs' motion be denied for the reasons stated in the prior briefing.

This notice applies to the Wave 9 cases identified in Plaintiffs' Exhibit A.<sup>1</sup>

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ William M. Gage

William M. Gage (MS Bar No. 8691)  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4561  
[william.gage@butlersnow.com](mailto:william.gage@butlersnow.com)

---

<sup>1</sup> Defendants note that several of the cases listed in Plaintiffs' Exhibit A have been terminated since the filing of their motion: Vera Boyd (No. 2:17-cv-03586), Joyce Clark (No. 2:15-cv-13857), Christy D. Conn (No. 2:14-cv-09938), and Peggy and Carl Wipperman (No. 2:16-cv-09243). No response is required in these closed matters.

/s/ Susan M. Robinson

Susan M. Robinson (W. Va. Bar No. 5169)

Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC

300 Summers Street

Suite 1380 (25301)

P.O. Box 3824

Charleston, WV 24338

(304) 414-1800

[srobinson@tcspllc.com](mailto:srobinson@tcspllc.com)

Counsel for Defendants

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on this day, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ William M. Gage  
William M. Gage

#47664877